



County Hall  
Cardiff  
CF10 4UW  
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir  
Caerdydd  
CF10 4UW  
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

## SUPPLEMENTARY PAPERS

<b>Committee</b>	ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
<b>Date and Time of Meeting</b>	TUESDAY, 6 SEPTEMBER 2016, 4.30 PM
<b>Venue</b>	COMMITTEE ROOM 4 - COUNTY HALL
<b>Membership</b>	Councillor Mitchell (Chair) Councillors Aubrey, Clark, Chris Davis, Hill-John, Lomax, White and Darren Williams

The following papers were marked 'to follow' on the agenda circulated previously

**David Marr**

**Interim Monitoring Officer**

Date: Wednesday, 31 August 2016

Contact: Graham Porter, 029 2087 3401, [g.porter@cardiff.gov.uk](mailto:g.porter@cardiff.gov.uk)

***This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg***

**11 Correspondence Following the Committee Meeting (Pages 1 - 66)**

This page is intentionally left blank

Ref: RDB/PM/RP/06.09.16

22 September 2016

Councillor Ramesh Patel,  
Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability,  
County Hall,  
Atlantic Wharf,  
Cardiff,  
CF10 4UW.



Dear Councillor Patel,

**Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 6 September 2016**

On behalf of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee I would like to thank you and the officers from City Operations for attending the Committee meeting on Tuesday 6 September 2016. As you are aware the meeting considered an item titled 'City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance Report 2016/17'. The comments and observations made by Members following this item are set out in this letter.

**City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance Report 2016/17**

- Members noted that work is currently being undertaken to reshape and improve Neighbourhood Services. They were told that a new set of measures is being developed alongside this work to ensure that service progress can be monitored and measured in future. I would be grateful if you and Councillor Derbyshire could arrange for the new Neighbourhood Services performance measures to be shared with the Committee once they are created so that feedback can be provided.
- The 'City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance Report 2016/17' stated that 17 performance indicators are included in the 'Directorate Delivery Plan'; of these eight are annual and nine are reported on a quarterly basis. From the nine quarterly indicators only four were published in the 'City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance

Report 2016/17' and five were omitted as they were 'awaiting validation'. Members were concerned about this as in effect they were scrutinising the performance of the City Operations Directorate with access to only 23.5% of the identified performance indicators. To enable more detailed scrutiny I would ask that the five indicators which are 'awaiting validation' are included in the 'City Operations Directorate – Quarter 2 Performance Report 2016/17'. If these are still 'awaiting validation' when the Quarter 2 report is published then I would suggest that they are supported with an appropriate caveat. I understand that there is some reluctance to publish performance indicators which are 'awaiting validation'; however, providing the Committee with non validated and caveated information is far better than providing nothing at all.

- The Committee were pleased to see that PLA/004(a) (the percentage of major planning applications determined during the year within 13 weeks) and PLA/004(c) (the percentage of household planning applications determined during the year within 8 weeks) were green in Quarter 1. Members would like to congratulate the Planning Service on this improvement after a series of amber and red results during 2015/16. The Committee hope that this progress continues and when it becomes available would like a copy of the benchmarking information which City Operations is gathering on how other local authorities report against these indicators.

I would be grateful if you would consider the above comments and provide a response to the requests made in this letter.

Regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "P. D. Mitchell". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

Councillor Paul Mitchell  
Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Cc:

Andrew Gregory - Director for City Operations

Matt Wakelam – Operational Manager, Infrastructure & Operations

Paul Keeping – Operational Manager, Scrutiny Services

Davina Fiore – Director for Governance & Legal Services

Members of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee

This page is intentionally left blank

Ref: RDB/PM/BD/06.09.16

22 September 2016

Councillor Bob Derbyshire,  
Cabinet Member for the Environment,  
County Hall,  
Atlantic Wharf,  
Cardiff CF10 4UW.



Dear Councillor Derbyshire,

**Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 6 September 2016**

On behalf of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee I would like to thank the officers from City Operations for attending the Committee meeting on Tuesday 6 September 2016. As you are aware the meeting considered an item titled 'City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance Report 2016/17', 'The City of Cardiff – Draft 2016 Air Quality Progress Report' and 'Cardiff Council Public Convenience Outline Strategy 2016'. The comments and observations made by Members following this item are set out in this letter.

**City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance Report 2016/17**

- Members noted that extensive work is currently being undertaken to reshape and improve Neighbourhood Services. They were told that this requires a new set of performance indicators to be developed alongside this work to ensure that service progress can be meaningfully monitored and measured in future. I would be grateful if you and Councillor Patel could arrange for the new Neighbourhood Services performance indicators to be shared with the Committee once they are created so that feedback can be provided.
- The 'City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance Report 2016/17' stated that 17 performance indicators are included in the 'Directorate Delivery Plan'; of these eight are annual and nine are reported on a

quarterly basis. From the nine quarterly indicators only four were published in the 'City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance Report 2016/17' and five were omitted as they were 'awaiting validation'.

Members were very concerned about this as in effect they were scrutinising the performance of the City Operations Directorate with access to only 23.5% of the identified performance data. To enable more detailed scrutiny I would ask that the five indicators which are 'awaiting validation' are included in the 'City Operations Directorate – Quarter 2 Performance Report 2016/17'. If these are still 'awaiting validation' when the Quarter 2 report is published then I would suggest that they are supported with an appropriately-worded caveat. I understand that there is some reluctance to publish performance indicators which are 'awaiting validation'; however, providing the Committee with non-validated and caveated information is far better than providing nothing at all.

- The Committee were informed that the Council is intending to launch a 'deep clean' exercise in several inner city wards and around some of the district shopping centres in the coming months. I would be grateful if you could provide the Members with further information on the 'deep clean' proposal, for example, when it will take place, how long it will take, the type of cleansing work that will take place and so on.
- During the meeting some Members raised a concern over the fly tipping incidents in flat communal areas and asked if there were any practical measures that the Council could apply to improve the situation; in particular they were keen to identify ways to improve enforcement. I'd be grateful if you and officers could help by providing the Committee with practical suggestions on how this issue can be addressed.
- A Member commented that the performance indicator results for the removal of fly tipping during Quarter 1 were very impressive. He continued by asking for more information on how these fly tipping results are collated and reported and the sources from which they are generated. I would be grateful if you could provide this information.



## **Commercial & Collaboration – Quarter 1 Performance 2016/17**

- Members note that the new Commercial & Collaboration service was established at the end of June 2016 and that the creation of performance indicators against which to measure progress may take a little time. The Joint Environmental and Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee letter written after the meeting on the 6 June made a number of performance management related requests for the new service which included:
  - That the new performance indicators are made available to scrutiny for consideration at the earliest possible opportunity;
  - That the new performance indicators; business plans and actions should clearly link back to the strategic objectives set out in the project;
  - That the progress of the new service needs to be properly monitored on a quarterly basis to ensure that savings and improvements are being delivered i.e. included in the Council's quarterly monitoring report;
  - That the individual areas within the 'Commercial & Collaboration' service are individually reported against within the quarterly performance reporting structure.

As a reminder of the views expressed by the Committee after the meeting on the 6 June copies of the letters sent to you and your response have been attached to this letter as **Appendices 1** and **2** respectively.

## **The City of Cardiff – Draft 2016 Air Quality Progress Report**

- The Committee felt that 'The City of Cardiff – Draft 2016 Air Quality Progress Report' was a thorough and well-constructed report. They would like to pass on their thanks to the officers from the Shared Regulatory Service for the time taken to prepare the document.
- Members were pleased that air quality standards have gradually improved in Cardiff and understand that this appears to be largely down to the gradual improvement of vehicle engines. To support this gradual

improvement the Committee would urge you to lobby all bus companies operating in the city and encourage them to introduce more low polluting hybrid vehicles; achieving this it is felt would help reduce air pollution particularly in the city centre.

- The Committee were informed that some local authorities constantly monitor air quality in Local Air Quality Management areas and have the ability and protocols in place to divert traffic if air pollution rises above a particular level, for example, from high levels of nitrogen dioxide. Swansea was cited as an example of where traffic was diverted when nitrogen dioxide rises above a particular level; I would be grateful if the officers could provide the Committee with the information on these schemes.

### **Cardiff Council Public Convenience Outline Strategy 2016**

- The Committee understands the importance of signposting the location of toilets in Cardiff to the public. They felt that the use of established 'third party apps' was a very effective and practical way of communicating this information and, therefore, would encourage you to take this approach as a key part of the wider strategy.
- During the meeting an officer from City Operations explained that Stirling Council had developed an excellent public conveniences strategy which focused on highlighting the toilet facilities across the city. I would be grateful if you could provide the Committee with information on the Stirling Council public conveniences strategy.
- A Member of the Committee who was involved with the 2008/09 Public Conveniences Inquiry suggested that officers should review the report as a point of reference for the development of the current public conveniences strategy. A copy of this report has been attached to this letter as **Appendix 3**.
- At the meeting a City Operations officer explained that the Vale of Glamorgan now has 30 'Changing Places' toilets; these were described as state of the art toilets which catered specifically for those with greater care

needs including facilities for carers to cater for the needs of disabled and incontinent children and adults. Members were interested in finding out more about these toilets, therefore, I would appreciate it if you could supply the Committee with information on the 'Changing Places' toilets.

- Members were concerned about the problem of urinating in public particularly in the city centre during the 'night-time economy' where the inebriated encounter the chill air. During the way forward the Committee discussed what could be done to better manage this problem and in doing so they suggested that:
  - The Council should run a 'go before you go' campaign to target public houses, restaurants and other licenced premises. Such a campaign would be designed to remind the people of the importance of visiting the toilet before leaving the establishment, therefore, reducing the number of incidents of urinating in public;
  - Explore the option of issuing penalty charge notices against those urinating in public places.

It would be appreciated if you could look into these ideas and provide the Committee with feedback.

- Members understand that the main aim of the strategy is to raise the profile of where public conveniences are located in Cardiff. They also acknowledge that at a time of financial pressure the Council is not in a position to fund new public convenience infrastructure, however, the Committee did comment that if funding were to become available in the near future for public convenience infrastructure then this should be allocated to projects in the city centre where the demand is highest but added that major shopping precincts should not be ignored.

I would be grateful if you would consider the above comments and provide a response to the requests made in this letter.

Regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "P. D. Mitchell". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

Councillor Paul Mitchell

Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Cc:

Andrew Gregory - Director for City Operations

Matt Wakelam – Operational Manager, Infrastructure & Operations

Neil Hanratty – Director for Economic Development

Tara King – Assistant Director, Commercial & Collaboration

Jane Cherrington – Operational Manager, Strategy & Enforcement

Dave Holland – Head of Shared Regulatory Services

Helen Picton – Operational Manager, Enterprise & Specialist Services

Jason Bale - Group Leader, Contaminated Land

Robert Gravelle – Section Leader H&S, BSI & EqIA

Davina Fiore – Director for Governance & Legal Services

Paul Keeping – Operational Manager, Scrutiny Services

Members of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee

s c r u t i n y



---

A Report of:  
Environmental Scrutiny Committee

## Provision of Public Conveniences

**April 2009**



County Council of The City and County of Cardiff

## CONTENTS

CONTENTS	2
CHAIR'S FOREWORD	3
TERMS OF REFERENCE	4
KEY FINDINGS	5
RECOMMENDATIONS	8
KEY EVIDENCE	11
Background	11
Current Legislation	11
Public Views & Opinions	14
British Toilet Association Survey	17
Site Visits	18
Possible Solutions and Funding	25
INQUIRY METHODOLOGY	33
LEGAL IMPLICATIONS	35
FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS	35
ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE TERMS OF REFERENCE	36
ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP	37
APPENDIX A	38
APPENDIX B	45
APPENDIX C	48

## CHAIR'S FOREWORD

The problem with toilets is that no-one wants to talk about them. So starts the editorial in the August 2008 issue of the international development magazine "New Internationalist". They were looking at a global problem but locally in Cardiff it is much the same. We are a proud capital – we continually say so. We are happy to enter Britain in Bloom, to have new libraries and shopping centres, to showcase world class stadia for sporting events and to host world class singing competitions but if we were to take a long hard look at the "away from home" loo facilities in this city we would be world renowned at the other end of the scale for all the wrong reasons. For too long the toilets in this city have been neglected and now they are, quite simply, awful. We are not providing in our parks, or for tourists, or for the night time economy. In short, when you are caught short in Cardiff there is nowhere remotely suitable to go. This has to change, both for the citizens of Cardiff but also for the increasing numbers of visitors who expect better from their experiences elsewhere. Failure to act will mean that we are in danger of suffering from serious reputational harm and that would be a further disadvantage when our city economy needs boosting not hindering.

As ever this report has benefited from excellent scrutiny services support from officers and from the research team who ran local workshops. A range of witnesses have provided input from both within and from outside the Council. The task and finish group commissioned an outside overview of Cardiff's facilities from the British Toilet Association and it has undertaken visits both around Cardiff and to Westminster. More than ever it is evidence based and the evidence is overwhelming.

I am grateful to everybody for their input which enables this Scrutiny Report to show the way to rectify the problem. It's neither difficult nor costly and I urge those tasked with providing such facilities in the city to seriously take on board its recommendations and not to simply flush them down the pan.



**Councillor Simon Wakefield**  
**Chairperson**

## TERMS OF REFERENCE

Terms of Reference for this Inquiry:

To review the provision of public conveniences available in Cardiff and determine how the Council can improve the provision -

- To build a picture of current public toilet provision, both in the city centre and the suburbs
- To review the condition and standard maintained in the facilities, sites, levels of usage and hours of operation
- To understand the problems and associated issues that can exist in providing (or not providing) public toilet provision
- Examine the management of Cardiff Council's public toilets, the cost-effectiveness and efficiency of the systems in place
- To investigate the options available to a local authority in providing public toilets
- Explore the co-ordination between service areas and the private sector



## KEY FINDINGS

KF1. Numerous pieces of evidence gathered throughout the inquiry suggest that the provision of public conveniences in Cardiff city centre and the suburbs is inadequate, and not of the standard one would expect to find in a world class European capital city, striving to ensure it has a clean, safe and attractive environment. The inquiry noted that the council has no legal obligation to provide public conveniences, however the evidence suggests that there is an expectation as a capital city to provide a satisfactory level of 'away from home' toilets for both its visitors and its citizens.

KF2. The management of the provision of public conveniences in Cardiff is currently split across four service areas. The range of provision comprises the city centre facilities, toilets in the Bay, facilities located in parks and cemeteries, and the toilets in the suburbs of the city. The British Toilet Association (BTA) encourages local authorities to develop a strategy for the provision of public toilets in their area. Whilst the task group was informed of the Highways and Waste Managements plans to develop a strategy for the city centre, there was no mention of a city wide strategy.

KF3. Both the BTA and the task group found there to be very little signposting of Cardiff's public conveniences throughout the entire city. In the areas of the city that attract high volumes of visitors, signage is vital.

KF4. The general standard of provision was considered by the BTA, the task group and the public was poor, and whilst most of the facilities were accessible they were not compliant with Part M of the Disability Discrimination Act 1995.

KF5. Throughout the inquiry the task group gathered evidence from the BTA and other councils on a variety of funding options available for improving existing provision and providing new facilities. These included capital purchase, lease financing, lease maintenance, equipment rental, advertise funding and charging for facilities.

KF6. Recent changes in the law allow local authorities to charge for the use of urinals as well as toilet cubicles. There are a number of issues to consider before making the decision to charge for toilet facilities. Consideration should be given to the effect charging for council facilities will have on other toilet providers in the area. People may choose to use the free facilities instead of the council provision. The BTA recommends careful consideration is given, and consultation with the public be sought, before any decision to charge for facilities is made.

KF7. The new plans for the bus box around the city centre could present an opportunity to locate toilet provision in areas of the city centre that see high influxes of tourists and citizens pass through, throughout the day. These facilities could also be the solution to the lack of provision for bus drivers throughout the city.

KF8. The task group established during the inquiry that there is no provision in the city centre for the night time economy. A number of solutions were highlighted by the BTA and Westminster Council. The preferred long term option of the Police and the BTA for the night time economy was the installation of a number of 'pop up' style urinals and or 'butterfly style urinals. These would be situated at key locations throughout the city centre, ideally in areas with a high density of bars, clubs and pubs, and on routes to taxi ranks and bus stops. In conjunction with this provision, and in order to encourage people to make use of these facilities, partnership working between the Council, the provider and the Police would be vital, and deterrents for not using the provided facilities would need to be enforced.

KF9. Community Toilet Schemes have been adopted in many English local authorities, and are now set to be funded by the Welsh Assembly Government. Whilst a seemingly viable solution to the lack of toilet provision in Cardiff, the BTA warns that it should not be the only solution, and should be used in conjunction with other options as a number of commercial premises may unintentionally discriminate against certain user groups, preventing them from accessing the facilities.

KF10. There are a number of council managed facilities in the city that provide toilets for their customers and it was felt by the task group that these Council run facilities could be signposted and made available to the public.

KF11. It became apparent during the site visits that there was very little toilet provision around the city for those people who are not office based and work out and about in the city, for example the police, traffic wardens, taxi drivers, street cleaners and bus drivers.

KF12. A solution to the lack of facilities for taxi drivers would be to look at locating a number of taxi rest bases at locations where public conveniences are situated, for example Llandaff Fields and Victoria Park. The drivers whilst grateful for the use of the facilities, would by their presence, in turn help police the venue and thus prevent vandalism and antisocial behaviour.

KF13. The BTA recommends that the toilets in both Kingsway and The Hayes would benefit from CCTV to reduce the levels of antisocial behaviour, vandalism and drug activity at the facilities. The Westminster attendants that the task group spoke with agreed that the installation of CCTV had been successful in reducing these problems.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

The task and finish group gathered evidence from a wide range of sources, which included hearing from council officers and external witnesses, undertaking visits both in Cardiff and Westminster, and obtaining the views of the public.

It has used the evidence gathered throughout the enquiry to inform its recommendations. The recommendations follow on from the key findings, and their aims are to help improve the provision of public conveniences throughout the whole of Cardiff.

The committee recommends the Executive:

R1. Provide satisfactory 'away from home' toilets for both its visitors and its citizens, in order to fulfil the ambition of becoming a world class European capital city. Through public consultation and the other advice and assistance of the British Toilet Association, Cardiff can improve the current 'well below standard' of public convenience provision in line with public expectation, be kept informed of new ideas and gain valuable insight and information from toilet providers.

R2. Produces a city wide Public Conveniences Strategy, with an emphasis on all four service areas working closely together to improve both the standard and availability of the 'away from home' toilet provision in Cardiff.

R3. Improve the signposting of public conveniences throughout the city, but especially in the city centre and areas that attract high tourist numbers.

R4. Consider the funding options available for providing new facilities and improving existing provision, ensuring they are compliant with DDA Part M requirements. The BTA and other councils suggest a variety of funding options are available for improving existing provision and providing new facilities, including capital purchase, lease financing, lease maintenance, equipment rental, advertise funding and charging for facilities.

R5. Begin a rolling programme of Capital expenditure over the next five years, to refurbish the cities public conveniences much like libraries and leisure centres have seen in recent years, starting with those located in parks, where high volumes of citizens and visitors would benefit from the improvement in facilities, and where the significantly poor standard of facilities puts the reputation of the city at stake.

R6. Consider installing an automated open and lock down system to the unmanned toilet facilities throughout the city, to provide a more reliable and secure service provision, whilst reducing staffing costs.

R7. Consider converting the Kingsway facilities into single sex toilets to reduce the staffing costs, which in turn could fund the much needed refurbishment and installation of CCTV.

R8. Find solutions to the lack of toilet provision for the night time economy in both the city centre and the Bay. Serious consideration should be given to the installation of pop up style urinals, butterfly style urinals and temporary pissoirs located in key areas of the city centre especially during infrastructure works, for example, St Mary Street. Whilst this may not completely eradicate the problem of street urination, it has been suggested by the BTA, the Police and Westminster City Council that it would go a long way to making the city centre a more hygienic and welcoming place to frequent during the evening. Consideration should also be given to the suggestion of local pubs, bars and clubs being approached to sponsor such facilities, and also to take into account the current work programme of refurbishment in the city centre, again to minimise the cost of installation of such facilities.

R9. Encourage partnership working through the WAG Community Toilet Scheme and look at the possibility of signposting people to Council owned facilities i.e. libraries, leisure centres as part of the WAG Community Toilet Scheme.

R10. Take into consideration the provision of public conveniences in all future planning applications, utilising every opportunity possible to improve the provision in the city, where any new venture is likely to attract a high volume of visitors, and thus will require adequate toilet provision.

R11. When drafting a response to this report, include an action plan giving details of the timescales for the implementation of the recommendations that have been accepted.

## KEY EVIDENCE

### BACKGROUND

1. Whilst councils have no legal obligation to provide public conveniences, evidence suggests that in order for Cardiff to achieve its ambition of becoming a world class European capital city, providing a clean, safe and attractive environment both for its visitors and its citizens, it is essential to deliver high quality public services, including 'away from home' toilet provision.
2. Cardiff Council currently owns 26 public conveniences, and leases 8 Automatic Public Toilets (APC) in Cardiff city centre and the surrounding suburbs. The facilities are managed under four different service areas:
  - Highways and Waste Management (9)
  - Economy, Enterprise and Infrastructure - Harbour Authority (5)
  - Culture, Leisure and Parks (15)
  - Strategic Planning and Environment - Bereavement (5)

### CURRENT LEGISLATION

3. The provision and maintenance of toilets in public places is at the discretion of local authorities who have the power, under section 87 of the Public Health Act 1936 to provide public conveniences, but not a duty to do so<sup>1</sup>.
4. Section 87 (3) (c) of the Public Health Act 1936 stated 'a local authority may charge such fees, for the use of any such conveniences, other than urinals, as they see fit'<sup>2</sup>. This piece of legislation was amended in April 2008 by the Sex Discrimination (Amendment of Legislation)

---

<sup>1</sup> Department for Communities and Local Government, Improving Public Access to Better Quality Toilets – A Strategic Guide, March 2008

<sup>2</sup> Public Health Act 1936, Section 87 – Provision of Public Conveniences

Regulations 2008, and now allows local authorities to charge for the use of all public conveniences, including urinals.

5. In the absence of specific legislation relating to the provision of public conveniences there are several other pieces of legislation which need to be considered when providing public services:
  - The Disability Discrimination Act 1995;
  - The Equality Act 2006;
  - The Public Lavatories (Turnstiles) Act 1963; and
  - The Anti-Social Behaviour Act 2003.
  
6. The Disability Discrimination Act 1995 requires service providers to do what is reasonably practicable in making adjustments to services so that they are accessible to disabled people. Additionally a requirement of the Disability Equality Duty, which came into force in December 2004, is to consider the needs of all sectors of the society they serve whilst promoting greater equality.
  
7. The Equality Act 2006 challenged all public authorities with promoting gender equality, giving local authorities the opportunity to consider ensuring a more balanced access to public toilets for men and women.
  
8. The Public Lavatories (Turnstiles) Act 1963 prohibits the use of turnstiles in any part of a public toilet managed or controlled by a local authority. This legislation came about following public concerns about the safety of turnstiles for specific users including pregnant women, disabled people and those people with luggage / bags of shopping.
  
9. The Anti Social Behaviour Act 2003 gives powers to the Police, Local Authority Officers and Community Support Officers to issue Fixed Penalty Notice's to anyone caught causing damage to property, including public toilets.



## Best practice

10. The BTA have established the following criteria for judging the quality of 'away from home' toilet provision:

Signage & Communication	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>§ Directional signage</li> <li>§ External building signage</li> <li>§ Internal customer communication signage</li> </ul>
Décor & Maintenance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>§ Adequate state of repair both internal and external</li> </ul>
Fixtures & Fittings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>§ Sufficient sanitary fittings, taps, locks on doors, hooks etc.</li> </ul>
Cleanliness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>§ Walls, ceilings and floor areas</li> <li>§ Fixtures and fittings - basins, bowls, seats, taps etc.</li> </ul>
Hygiene Equipment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>§ Hand washing and drying facilities</li> <li>§ Supply toilet tissue</li> <li>§ Provide sanitary product disposal</li> </ul>
Air Quality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>§ Ventilation, drainage smells etc.</li> </ul>
Extras	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>§ Added value enhancement - vending, flowers etc.</li> </ul>
Security	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>§ Sufficient lighting including entrances and external areas</li> </ul>
Accessible Facilities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>§ DDA compliant provision for both sexes or a unisex facility</li> </ul>
Baby Changing Facilities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>§ Provision for both sexes or a unisex facility</li> </ul>
Overall Management & Customer Care	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>§ Clear evidence that the facilities are being properly managed</li> </ul>

11. The attributes of a good toilet facility can also be summarised as:

- § Open – if it is not open, it is of no use;
- § Clean – people do not like standing on a wet floor because “you don’t know what it is” and for wheelchair users it is particularly unpleasant if the floor is wet and the floor is littered with toilet paper and rubbish as it gets on their hands;
- § Safe – including good lighting, situated in a busy location, with no signs of anti social behaviour and an attendant present; and
- § Well stocked – with toilet paper, soap, hot water and hand drying facilities.

12. The BTA suggests that the level of provision at a public toilet should meet the needs of all users i.e. ladies, gents, children, babies, older people and those with physical or mental disability. These toilets should be available when the users need them as many people with medical conditions must use a toilet facility when they need it, and often won’t leave home or travel unless they are available.

13. The BTA recommends that all major cities offer ‘Changing Places’ toilet facilities. These specifically designed toilets cater for those who need assistance from hoists and lifts to use the facilities.

## **PUBLIC VIEWS AND OPINIONS**

### **Public Conveniences Workshop**

14. To enable the task group to gain a public view of Cardiff’s current toilet provision, the Scrutiny Research Team facilitated a public workshop at City Hall in November 2008. Representatives from different user groups were invited to attend and take part in a structured workshop. The executive summary of the Scrutiny Research Team report can be found in Appendix A.

15. The user group's satisfaction with the Council's existing public conveniences provision was rated by most groups as "poor", with the ratings of the privately provided and managed facilities ranging from "fairly poor" to "very good".
16. The most important issues that the groups encounter when using public conveniences were found to be:
- § Overall cleanliness, this included the competency of the cleaners;
  - § Insufficient number of units in most facilities, especially during large scale events in the city centre and large park areas across the city;
  - § Accessibility, the importance of recognising and compliance with BS8300 design standard for toilets for disabled people; and
  - § Security and safety, including the reputation and location of certain facilities, and the need for audio and visual alarms in accessible facilities.
17. When asked 'what a reasonable charge to pay per use would be', the majority of groups felt that if improvements were made to cleanliness, accessibility, security and safety, then twenty pence per use would be reasonable.
18. Representatives from a group with medical problems, including incontinence, were invited to the workshop but felt they could not attend due to the embarrassment their condition can cause. The review of literature carried out by the Scrutiny Research Team highlighted the concerns and issues experienced by those with medical problems and the elderly in relation to public toilets. They stated that older people find their activities curtailed by the availability of public toilets, and are only able to travel as far as time will reasonably allow before they have to return home to use the toilet. Help the Aged conducted a survey of almost 1000 older people's views of public toilet provision in the UK, entitled 'Nowhere to Go'. Of the respondents 80%

did not find it easy to find a public toilet, with 78% per cent of respondents finding that their local public toilets were not open when they need them<sup>3</sup>.

## **Complaints**

19. Over the past year a number of complaints have been written to the Council or to the South Wales Echo regarding the standard of toilets provision in Cardiff. The letters express feelings of disgust at the disgraceful and dirty provision in parks around the city, stating “a very pleasant day was ruined by the lack or standard of toilet provision”. Other complaints included “the lack of disabled provision in the town centre”, and “the unfairness of disabled people having to travel the length of the city centre just to find an accessible loo”.

## **Capital Times survey**

20. Following an advertisement placed in the Capital Times requesting comments from the public on the provision of public conveniences in September 2008, fifteen responses were received. The comments, all from members of the public included:

- § A lack of ‘accessible’ facilities in the city centre;
- § A dislike of ‘pod style’ APC toilets;
- § Support for restoration of The Hayes toilets;
- § A lack of adequate provisions in parks within the city;
- § A lack of provision both in the city centre and outside of the centre; and
- § Complaints regarding cleanliness.

## **Tourist Information**

21. Visitor Satisfaction Questionnaires have been conducted over a number of years into the ‘Visitors experience of Cardiff’. The responses are non-prompted and come from the question “What would

---

<sup>3</sup> Nowhere to Go, Help the Aged, accessed 30<sup>th</sup> September 2008, <[http://www.helptheaged.org.uk/en-gb/campaigns/neighbourhoods/publictoilets/neighbourhoods\\_publictoilets\\_default.htm](http://www.helptheaged.org.uk/en-gb/campaigns/neighbourhoods/publictoilets/neighbourhoods_publictoilets_default.htm)

you like to see improved in Cardiff". In general the findings over the past few years are relatively consistent and include the following:

- 2005/06      Comments were made regarding poor toilet provision, toilets being closed, poor cleanliness & hygiene and the need for more toilets
- 2006/07      3.3% of the respondents would like to see an improvement in public toilets, comments were again made regarding poor provision, poor cleanliness & hygiene and the need for more toilets, but also regarding the need for better signage to the toilets in the city centre
- 2007/08      Comments were made regarding the need for more toilets and better signage

## **BRITISH TOILET ASSOCIATION SURVEY**

- 22. The task group commissioned the British Toilet Association (BTA) to conduct a survey of approximately one quarter of the toilets managed by the Council, from across all four service areas. The executive summary of the BTA's report can be found in Appendix B.
- 23. The BTA's overall summary of toilet provision found that Cardiff's 'mature toilets' are not generally best equipped for current needs, with hot and cold water supplies in only half the toilets surveyed and some with no hand washing facilities at all. Cleaning standards in a third of the toilets surveyed was found to be less than average and very few facilities had mirrors, hooks for hanging handbags or coats, feminine hygiene disposal and baby changing facilities.
- 24. Although many of the facilities surveyed were accessible, they failed to meet Disability Discrimination Act (DDA) Part M compliance, confirming the concerns expressed by the Equalities Team who stated that the already limited numbers of toilets in Cardiff are in many cases not DDA Part M compliant, they also pointed out that the alternative provision within retail and hotels is also rarely compliant. Signage to the toilet

facilities was also very poor, with very little directional signage found throughout the entire city.

## **SITE VISITS**

25. The task group undertook two visits as part of this inquiry, the first to various sites around Cardiff to gain first hand experience of the standard of provision, and the second to the London Borough of the City of Westminster to identify possible solutions for tackling antisocial behaviour and the night time economy. During the Cardiff visits Members discovered that many of the toilets were in a poor state of repair, and in need of modernisation. It also became apparent during the site visits that there was very little toilet provision around the city for those people who are not office based and work out and about in the city, for example the police, traffic wardens, taxi drivers, street cleaners and bus drivers.

### **City Centre - Day Time Provision**

26. The Highways and Waste Management Service Area manage and maintain the City Centre toilet provision, which currently consists of:

- § Frederick Street – Automatic Public Convenience (APC);
- § The Hayes, including the accessible facilities at The Hayes Island Café; and
- § Kingsway.

27. The 24 hour leased APC is fully accessible with baby changing facilities and costs twenty pence per use. However the APC is not ideally situated, it is currently located in Frederick Street, a small side street just off Queen Street. Although Queen Street is very popular with shoppers in the city centre, the signposting to this toilet provision is very poor and many shoppers would walk past the APC, some not even realising it was a toilet. It was also evident during the BTA's inspection of this toilet whilst clean and attractive from the outside, once inside it was spoilt by a lack of maintenance. There was limited hand washing facilities i.e. no hot water and no soap, and the unit was

in fact not DDA compliant. The baby changing unit had also been removed, thus leaving the unit not suitable for use as a baby changing facility either.

28. The Hayes toilets which opened in 1898 are situated underground and are Grade 1 Victorian Listed Buildings. The Hayes facilities are open from 7am to 6pm, 7 days a week and undergo daily inspections, are free at the point of use and have site attendants on duty during opening hours. Faults are reported to and dealt with by the Council Maintenance Team. The facilities are subject to vandalism although this has improved with the presence of permanent attendants. South Wales Police are called out at least once a month to the toilets in The Hayes for incident of indecent exposure and other sexual activities associated with public conveniences.
29. The Hayes public conveniences are in poor condition with no hot water provided at the facilities at all. Some maintenance works were carried out in 1980, but these facilities are now badly in need of refurbishment. Highways and Waste Management have recently been allocated Section 106 money for drainage works and repairs to the railings through the St David's 2 development work, and are awaiting approval from the Landfill tax credit scheme ENTRUST for funding to complete restoration works to the underground facilities.
30. Due to the age and location of these toilets, and in order to provide accessible facilities to the public, a management agreement has been drawn up between the Council and the proprietor of The Hayes Island Café. Under the agreement the proprietor must allow access to the toilet facilities (on ground level located to the rear of his premises), free of charge, for those members of the public unable to access the underground facilities. Evidence from the both the BTA and the Councils Equalities Team suggest that although The Hayes Island Café toilet facility is at ground level and is described as 'accessible', it is not DDA Part M compliant.

31. Kingsway facilities are open from 7am to 6pm, 7 days a week and undergo daily inspections, are free at the point of use and have site attendants on duty during opening hours. Faults are reported to and dealt with by the Council Maintenance Team. Kingsway public conveniences are desperately in need of refurbishment and their location in the subway does not make them especially welcoming. Youths congregate in the subway and the facilities are subject to vandalism, drug related issues and anti-social behaviour.
32. South Wales Police suggest that antisocial behaviour is big problem at both The Hayes and Kingsway toilets, they receive regular reports regarding drug dealing and have had two incidents of robbery in the last six months in the locality of the Kingsway toilets. The police also stated that around 50% of incidents do not get reported.
33. The recent demolition of the toilets in Wood Street, also previously managed by Highways and Waste Management, has enabled The Hayes and Kingsway to be manned full time at an annual cost of £285,000. Temporary toilets have been located in Great Western Lane and are currently being managed by the Special Projects Team.
34. No usage figures are available for the attended toilets, however a footfall survey was undertaken in December 2005 and figures for a Saturday show approximately 4800 people used the Council's three toilet provisions in the City Centre:
- § The Hayes – 1900 people
  - § Kingsway – 636 people
  - § Wood Street – 2272 people
35. The large number of people using the toilets that were located in Wood Street during this survey suggests that the public make good use of facilities at bus and train stations, and that there is a need for toilet



provision for the large numbers of visitors arriving at in the city via these methods of transport.

### **Cardiff Bay - Day Time Provision**

36. The Economy, Enterprise and Infrastructure Service Area - Harbour Authority currently manages and maintains the following public conveniences in the Bay:

- § Britannia Park;
- § Havannah Street;
- § Barrage (temporary facilities); and the
- § Barrage Environment Building.

37. These facilities, none of which are manned, are open during daylight hours only and are cleaned and maintained by Community Maintenance Services. An APC originally situated in The Hayes prior to the St David's 2 redevelopment works began is also due to be relocated by the Harbour Authority in the Bay area.

### **City Centre & Cardiff Bay - Night Time Provision**

38. With approximately 100,000 people in the city centre on a Friday and Saturday night, and with this number increasing by an additional 75,000 when there is an International match or event in the Millennium Stadium, Cardiff city centre has just one public toilet to serve the night time economy. Located in Freddrick St, the APC costs twenty pence per use and is not best positioned to attract users of the city centre in the evening. There is no evening provision in the Bay either, with all public facilities closing at dusk. As a result of the lack of evening economy toilet provision, both in the city centre and the Bay, people are often caught urinating in public.

39. Urinating in public is not actually an offence, but if it is found to be causing harassment or distress to another person, then a Penalty Notice for Disorder can be issued under the Section 5 Public Disorder Act, this is an £80 fine which has to be paid within 21 days. If the

individual committing the offence has previously been given a Penalty Notice then they can not be issued with another one, instead they must be arrested. Thus the majority of people found to be urinating in street on Friday and Saturday night, are given “words of advice”. With life threatening situations often requiring attention, and limited custody cell capacity, people are not usually arrested for urinating.

40. The most likely offenders of urinating in public are the people least likely to be committing an offence usually. A natural reaction of the human body, when moving from a warm environment to a cold one to need to urinate. This coupled with excessive drinking and lengthy cues for the next club or taxi rank only exasperates the instance of needing the toilet. Whilst urinating in public within the City Centre does not directly affect violent crime, it is offensive and unhygienic, and gives a lasting impression of the view of our city centre.

### **Parks Provision**

41. The Culture, Leisure and Parks Service Area – Outdoor Leisure Department manage and maintain the unattended public conveniences in the City and those located in Parks. A stock which currently consists of:

#### Unattended public conveniences

- § Cowbridge Road East
- § Llandaff City
- § Llandaff Fields
- § Whitchurch Road

#### Parks provisions

- § Caerdelyn Parc
- § Waterloo Gardens
- § Cefn On Park North
- § Cefn On Park South
- § Roath Park Lake East
- § Roath Park Lake West

- § Victoria Park
- § Splott Park
- § Thompson Park
- § Sophia Gardens Car Park
- § Pontcanna Caravan Site

42. Following a restructure of the service areas the management of unattended toilets in the city was transferred to Culture, Leisure and Parks in April 2006. As a result, many of the toilets managed by Culture, Leisure and Parks are not actually in parks. The toilets at Cefn On, Roath and Victoria parks are not attended, but have staff that check on them frequently during the day, especially during the summer months when usage is high. The remaining sites are unattended and are currently managed under a Service Level Agreement (SLA), (a contractor opens and cleans each facility every day, and returns in the evening to lock the facilities). As these toilets are unmanned for long periods of time, they are prone to vandalism and improper usage. The most frequently vandalised site at present is Llandaff Fields. Due to increased traffic during rush hour and the all too often discovery of vandalism or additional cleaning upon arrival, it can sometimes be mid day before some of these facilities are opened.

### **Cemetery Provision**

43. The Strategic Planning and Environment Service Area – Bereavement Services manage and maintain the public conveniences situated within the grounds of the City’s Crematoriums and Cemeteries:

- § Pantmawr;
- § Thornhill Entrance;
- § Thornhill Crematorium;
- § Cathays Cemetery; and
- § Western Cemetery.

44. Although the Bereavement Service’s toilet facilities are open to all users, it is essentially only visitors, people walking through, or

contractors on the site that use them. Bereavement Service's facilities are cleaned and maintained by staff on site and very rarely have problems with vandalism and anti social behaviour.

45. The BTA report of the sample toilet surveyed in Bereavement Services was found to be DDA compliant and generally of a good standard, however it was not well signposted. This facility is typical of that found in the other sites, as confirmed on the site visits carried out by the task group.

### **Suburban Provision**

46. The Highways and Waste Management Service Area are responsible for a number of APC's, leased by the Council, located around the City in the following suburbs:

- § Albany Road;
- § Delta Street, Canton;
- § Four Elms Road, Adamsdown;
- § Penlline Road, Whitchurch;
- § Ty Glas Road, Llanishen; and
- § Heol Y Deri, Rhiwbina.

47. The APC's are open 24 hours a day, with the exception of Heol Y Deri, which due to the Church grounds it is situated upon opens 8am to 6pm. All of the APC's (except Heol Y Deri) are supplied and maintained by a toilet provider at an approximate annual cost of £160,000 per year, excluding water and power costs. They are leased under a 20 year contract which began in 1996. One years notice is required for the termination of the contract and currently it would cost approximately £325,000 to end the contract early. The APC in Heol Y Deri is supplied and maintained by a different toilet provider to the other APC's, costs approximately £16,000 per year to run and to terminate this agreement a six months notice period is required.

48. All APC's undergo weekly inspections and faults are reported to the relevant contractors, many suffer problems with antisocial behaviour including drug related crime. The APC most frequently misused in relation to drugs has approximately 1000 needles a month removed from the unit.

49. The cost to use an APC is twenty pence per use, and all are accessible. The annual usage of the APC's for 2007/08 is as follows, and is determined by the income generated at each unit:

- § Albany Road – 7700
- § Delta Street, Canton – 2560
- § Four Elms Road, Adamsdown – 3030
- § Frederick Street – 6340
- § Penlline Road – 1970
- § Ty Glas Road – 960
- § Heol y Deri – 280

50. The task group expressed concern at the high annual contract costs in relation to the relatively small usage of some of the APC's, especially Heol Y Deri in Rhiwbina. Whilst the task group acknowledged the leasing contract for the APC's runs for a further seven years, and that the cost to terminate the contract early is not an option at present, it may well be worth while terminating the contract before the full 20 years is up. It was also discovered during the inquiry that a number of suburbs that have shopping areas, have no toilet provision at all.

## **POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS AND FUNDING**

51. Although toilet provision is a discretionary service, the decision to remove or move forward needs to be addressed, remembering the balance between the health and well being of the city's citizens and its visitors, over the cost of providing and maintaining public conveniences. The opinions of the BTA, the task group and the citizens of Cardiff would suggest that there is a need for the Council to

provide a good standard of 'away from home' toilet facilities throughout the city.

52. Throughout the inquiry the task group gathered evidence from the BTA and other Councils, on a variety of funding options available for providing public conveniences. These included capital purchase, lease financing, lease maintenance, equipment rental, funding through the use of advertising and charging for facilities.
53. The recent change in the law, now allows local authorities to charge for the use of urinals as well as toilet cubicles however there are a number of issues to consider before making the decision to charge for toilet facilities. Consideration should be given to the effect charging for Council facilities will have on other toilet providers in the area. If other toilet facilities are provided free of charge, people may choose to use the free facilities instead of the Council provision. As charges are made for using the facilities, the running costs of the premises will decrease, as the vandalism decreases, however it costs to charge, as there is a need to collect and bank the income. The BTA recommend careful consideration is given, and consultation with the public be sought, before any decision to charge for facilities is made.
54. Highways and Waste Management are currently working on a City Centre Public Conveniences Strategy, however the task group and the BTA can see the benefits to this being extended and developed to incorporate the whole city, and cover all service area provisions. As part of the Council Wide Public Conveniences Strategy, the BTA strongly recommend the need for the Council to consult with the public, to gain an understanding of their views and needs.
55. The signposting of Cardiff's public conveniences was found by both the BTA and the task group to be extremely poor throughout the entire city. In the city centre and the city's parks, signage is vital. Local residents

are often aware of where the nearest public toilet is, but the many thousands of visitors to the city are not.

56. The task group was advised by the BTA that many cities only site one attendant at an attended toilet facility. The reduction in staffing costs could in turn help to generate the capital to invest in the refurbishment of facilities.
57. Evidence from the BTA and the Equalities Team suggests that many of the toilets across the city are failing to meet DDA requirements, and are well below an acceptable standard of repair. With pressures on the revenue budget, the task group would suggest that a rolling programme of capital expenditure be considered to refurbish the cities public conveniences, starting with those located in parks, where high volumes of citizens and visitors would benefit from the improvement in facilities, and where the significantly poor standard of facilities puts the reputation of the city at stake. Over the past few years the Council has successfully refurbished a number of the cities leisure facilities and libraries in the same way.
58. As part of the refurbishment of these facilities, consideration could be given to installing an electronic open and lock down system for those toilets currently managed under the Service Level Agreement (SLA). Savings could be made by cancelling the SLA, an electronic system would ensure toilets are opened and closed at regular times, and parks staff could be better utilised to clean these facilities.
59. The BTA recommends that where possible, new facilities are located near to, or incorporated into other businesses or premises. Commercial operators often take 'ownership' of the toilet directly outside or that is part of their building, which leads to a decrease in the problems often associated with toilets.

60. A solution to the lack of facilities for taxi drivers could be to look at locating a number of taxi rest bases at locations where public conveniences are also situated, for example Llandaff Fields and Victoria Park. Whilst the drivers would be grateful for the use of the facilities, the BTA stated that their presence could in turn, be beneficial in helping to police the venue, preventing the occurrence of vandalism and antisocial behaviour at such sites.

### **Community Toilet Scheme**

61. A new £385,000 public facilities scheme to encourage businesses to open their toilets to the general public in Wales was announced by the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, Dr Brian Gibbons, in August 2008. The public facilities scheme will encourage local authorities to work in partnership with businesses to improve the provision of safe, hygienic and accessible toilet facilities. Under the new scheme, launched on 2 April 2009, local councils will be funded by the Welsh Assembly Government (WAG) by up to £18,000 a year to fund local businesses to allow public access to their toilet facilities<sup>4</sup>.

62. The new 'Community Toilet Scheme' will offer local businesses up to £500 per year, in return for opening their toilet facilities to the public. Each business taking part in the scheme will be identified by displaying a sign in the window of the premises, and will be inspected by the council routinely to ensure compliance with the schemes partnership agreement.

63. Whilst a seemingly viable solution to the lack of toilet provision in Cardiff, the BTA warns that it should not be the only solution, and should be used in conjunction with other options. Many commercial premises may be pubs, and thus restrict certain user groups from accessing the facilities. Families, the elderly and certain religious groups may feel uncomfortable with entering such places.

---

<sup>4</sup> WAG Press Release – Businesses encouraged to open their toilets facilities to the public, 20 August 2008



Consideration should also be given to the opening times of the premises included in the toilet scheme.

64. It was acknowledged throughout the inquiry that toilet provision is not only provided by the council. There are a variety of privately managed businesses and companies in the city that provide toilets specifically for their customers, and would be eligible to take part in the WAG Community Toilet Scheme, for example restaurants, food outlets, large shopping complexes and individual stores. There are also a number of Council managed facilities in the city that provide toilets for their customers, for example The Old Library, City Hall, New Theatre, Leisure Centres and Libraries.

65. Whilst understandably the private operators of these provisions do not, and should not, have to encourage, or advertise the use of their facilities free of charge, to the citizens and visitors of the city, it was felt by the task group that the Council run facilities could be signposted and made available to the public. An example where this has already been achieved is with the refurbishment of the Roath Community Hall and Penylan Library. The extremely problematic toilets on Ninian Rd were demolished as part of the refurbishment. New toilet provision is now inside the new building, Penylan Library and Community Centre, where they can be managed and maintained much more effectively. However as the centre is not open on a Sunday, the toilet provision will be unavailable on possibly one of the busiest days of the week for the adjacent park.

### **Antisocial Behaviour**

66. The BTA recommends that both Kingsway and The Hayes would benefit from CCTV to reduce the levels of antisocial behaviour, vandalism and drug activity at the facilities. This solution is one that the task group witnessed during their visit to Westminster. The majority of public conveniences in Westminster had CCTV installed and also displayed warning signs in prominent places. The attendants that the

task group spoke with agreed that the installation of CCTV had been successful in reducing vandalism, antisocial behaviour and drug activity. Consideration could also be given to a Cardiff Community Safety Partnerships project aimed at reducing crime and disorder, and antisocial behaviour in and around the city's public conveniences.

67. Whilst drug activity is unlikely to be eradicated completely, the BTA suggested it was better to manage the situation than to ignore it. If possible at existing provision and certainly at new or refurbished facilities, sharps bins should be designed into the walls or units, so that needles cannot be retrieved. This not only reduces the likelihood of discarded needles being left to be reused or cause injury to someone else, but also gives anyone with a genuine medical reason for using needles, somewhere to safely dispose of them.

### **Night Time Economy**

68. Although the BTA suggested that The Hayes and Kingsway could open 24 hours to provide for the night time economy, the view of South Wales Police was that this would make the toilets extremely hard to police, and they would almost certainly see an increase in crimes committed at these facilities. It was also highlighted that the locations of these two facilities was not on the main route followed by the night time users of the City Centre, and generally people do not go out of their way to find a toilet, especially when drunk.

69. The Council's Special Events Team hire in temporary toilets for large Council run events, such as Winter Wonderland and the Coopers Field Fireworks display. These are either individual units or trailer style facilities, and whilst not suitable for the night time economy, would be suitable for match days and weekends when the Millennium Stadium was host to large capacity crowds. The Council does not currently provide temporary toilets for such events as they are not Council run, but have, in the past, piloted the idea. A few years ago temporary

'pissiors' were used outside the Owain Glyndwr in St Johns Square during a weekend of major events in the Stadium. The 'pissiors' were well used and reduced the problem of people urinating in the street, however this temporary toilet solution is costly and was considered by the task group to be a short term measure. The task group also considered the suggestion of purchasing a bank of temporary toilets in an 'invest to save' project. The Service Area responsible for the temporary toilets could then hire out the provision to the Special Events Team (and any other Service Area running an event), helping to keep the money within the Council and paying back the cost of purchasing the units and maintaining them.

70. Members suggested the Council could impose an additional charge on the licensing fees for events at the Millennium Stadium to subsidise the cost of erecting temporary 'pissiors', however upon investigation it was found that the licensing fee is set nationally by the Government and the Local Authority has no control over the level of fees. The licensing authority also has no ability to make charges on a licensed premise other than those permitted by statute in connection with a licence application. It is unable to impose conditions on an applicant other than at the time of application or review, and in any event the conditions can only relate to the use of the premises. The Government have made clear to licensing authorities in its statutory guidance that "in the context of preventing public nuisance, it is essential that conditions are focused on measures within the direct control of the licence holder or club. Conditions relating to public nuisance caused by anti-social behaviour of customers once they are beyond the control of the licence holder, club or premises management cannot be justified and will not serve to promote the licensing objectives".

71. The preferred long term option of the Police, the BTA and of the task group, for the night time economy, was the installation of a number of 'pop up' style urinals and or 'butterfly style urinals, at key locations throughout the City Centre, ideally in areas with a high density of bars,

clubs and pubs, and on routes to taxi ranks and bus stops. In conjunction with this provision, and in order to encourage people to make use of these facilities, it was suggested partnership working between the Council, the provider and the Police would be vital, and that deterrents for not using the facilities be enforced.

72. The BTA also suggested that other cities have made use out of empty shops along the busy thoroughfare of the city's night life to locate toilet provision. With new design ideas, and modern features and equipment available this idea need not stick out like a sore thumb! It was also recommended that the council encouraged the designing out of recesses, for future buildings.

### **Sustainability**

73. Throughout the enquiry consideration was given to a number of products on the market in relation to toilets and sustainability. A number of these were deemed to be unsuitable for high volume public usage, and a number of ideas have been tried throughout the different service areas to reduce energy and save water, and are not without their problems. The Smart Flush Urinals System was found to be suitable for public toilets. The passive infrared urinal control system saves water, only flushing when the urinal has been used, rather than every 10 minutes irrespective of whether it has been used.

74. Water Free Urinals can contribute positively to the environment, they do not use water for drainage and the sealing liquid is biodegradable, however the BTA suggest they require an effective cleaning regime to minimise bacteria and consequential odour build up in the urinal, and that their effectiveness has yet to be universally recognised.

## INQUIRY METHODOLOGY

75. A task & finish group of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee undertook a scrutiny inquiry on the provision of public conveniences in Cardiff between November 2008 and April 2009. During the inquiry the task group heard evidence from the following witnesses:

Internal Witnesses:

David Lowe – Operational Manager Waste Management  
Juliet Gamlin – Area Manager Cleaner Cardiff  
Adam Beach – Manager Outdoor Leisure

External Witnesses:

Sergeant Scott Lloyd – Cardiff Central Neighbourhood Policing Team  
Jon Griffiths – Westminster City Council  
Mike Bone – British Toilet Association  
Alistair Humphreys – InterPublic Urban Systems UK Ltd  
Roger Berry – Healthmatic  
Piers Dibben – Healthmatic  
Ross Longbottom – Danfo UK Ltd

76. Written evidence was also provided by the following:

Carmel Thomas – Bereavement Services  
Graham Adams – Harbour Authority  
Rob Gravelle – Equalities Team  
Rob Corp – Events Team  
Geoff Shimell – Legal Services  
Paul Shone – Licensing & Strategic Services  
Edward Townsend – Tourist Information

77. The Scrutiny Research Team was commissioned to facilitate a 'public conveniences workshop' in November 2008. Representatives from different user groups were invited to take part in a structured workshop, to obtain the views and opinions of Cardiff's current toilet provision.

## LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

78. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without modification. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Executive / Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal power of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. standing orders and financial regulations; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

## FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

79. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications.

# ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

## TERMS OF REFERENCE

To scrutinise, measure and actively promote improvement in the Council's performance in the provision of services and compliance with Council policies, aims and objectives in the area of environmental sustainability, including:

- **Strategic Planning Policy**
- **Sustainability Policy**
- **Environmental Health Policy**
- **Public Protection Policy**
- **Strategic Transportation Partnership**
- **South East Wales Transport Alliance**
- **Licensing Policy**
- **Waste Management**
- **Strategic Waste Projects**
- **Street Cleansing**
- **Cycling and Walking**
- **Streetscape**
- **Transport Policy and Development**
- **Intelligent Transport Solutions**
- **Public Transport**
- **Parking Management**

To assess the impact of external organisations including the National Assembly for Wales, Assembly Sponsored Public Bodies and quasidepartmental non-governmental bodies on the effectiveness of Council service delivery.

To report to an appropriate Executive or Council meeting on its findings and to make recommendations on measures, which may enhance Council performance in this area.



# ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

## MEMBERSHIP



Councillor  
Simon Wakefield  
(Chairperson)



Councillor  
Gareth Aubrey



Councillor  
Elizabeth Clark



Councillor  
Roderick Mckerlich



Councillor  
Ron Page



Councillor  
Jacqueline Parry



Councillor  
Keith Parry



Councillor  
Simon Pickard



Councillor  
Monica Walsh

Scrutiny Services, Cardiff County Council

6 The Courtyard, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff CF10 4UW

Tel: 029 2087 2296 Fax: 029 2087 2579 Email: [scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk](mailto:scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk)

© 2009 Cardiff County Council

## **APPENDIX A**

User groups' experiences of public conveniences in Cardiff:

An examination of user groups' experiences, issues and concerns regarding the existing provision for public conveniences in Cardiff

Cardiff Council Scrutiny Research Team

February 2009

### **Executive Summary**

#### **1.1 Introduction**

This research has been conducted as part of an inquiry into the provision of public conveniences available in Cardiff, undertaken by the Cardiff Council Environment Scrutiny Committee.

The data was mainly gathered through one interactive workshop with representatives of a range of public conveniences 'user groups', including:

- § Older people
- § Disabled people
- § People with medical problems e.g. incontinence
- § Parents with young children
- § Children and young people's organisations
- § Women's organisations
- § Black and minority ethnic groups (BME)
- § Outside workers e.g. taxi drivers, market stall operators, street cleaners, public transport user groups etc.
- § Lesbian, gay bisexual and transgender organisations (LGBT)
- § Students organisations

This research set out to:

- Determine the level of satisfaction with existing provision for public conveniences;

- Identify the specific problems that users have experienced when using public conveniences;
- Identify the specific needs of individual user groups that are currently unmet;
- Determine the relative importance of various aspects or features of public conveniences to each user group;
- Validate the key findings of previous consultation on public conveniences;
- Explore the feasibility of charging options.

### ***Users' satisfaction of public conveniences***

1.2 The groups were asked to rate the specific features and facilities related to public conveniences out of the following range:

- § very good
- § fairly good
- § fairly poor
- § very poor

Most groups rated the Council's existing provision as "poor" (i.e. fairly poor or very poor).

Most groups rated the specific features and facilities in privately managed facilities as comparatively better than those managed by the Council. However, several groups felt that certain features in privately provided facilities were only marginally better than Council provided facilities. These included the 'parent and toddler facilities' and 'access', 'waste disposal facilities', 'availability and helpfulness of attendants', and 'sustainability provisions' within the facilities. Most groups were in agreement that the 'provision for breast feeding areas' and 'emergency features<sup>5</sup>' were "poor" in both Council and private facilities. A summary of the ratings of Council provided and privately provided public conveniences is outlined in Table 1. This table reflects the range of ratings allocated by the different groups.

---

<sup>5</sup> For example: panic, assault and emergency buttons

Table 1: Comparison of levels of satisfaction with council and privately provided and managed facilities:

<b>Public convenience features and facilities</b>	<b>Council provided and managed facilities</b>	<b>Private provided and managed facilities</b>
Availability (opening hours, location and signage)	mostly poor – fairly poor	mostly fairly good – very good
Access (size, number of units, disabled access, access to specific features)	mostly poor	mostly fairly poor – fairly good
Parent and toddler facilities & access	mostly poor	mostly fairly poor – fairly good
Breast feeding area	mostly poor	mostly poor
Provision for emergency consumables	poor – fairly good	mostly fairly good – very good
Cleanliness	mostly poor	from fairly poor – mostly fairly good
Waste disposal (sanitary and incontinence products)	mostly poor	mostly poor - fairly good
Supply of basic consumables, hand washing & drying facilities	*mostly poor – fairly poor	fairly poor – mostly fairly good
Ambience	mostly poor – fairly poor	fairly poor – mostly fairly good
Attendants	mostly poor – fairly poor	mostly poor – fairly good
Security and safety	mostly poor	mostly good – very good
Emergency features	mostly poor	mostly poor
Graffiti and vandalism	poor – mostly fairly poor	fairly poor – fairly good
Feeling of security	poor – fairly poor	fairly good – very good
Sustainability concerns	mostly poor	mostly fairly poor

(range: very poor, fairly poor, good, very good)

### ***Perceived importance of specific features and facilities***

1.3 Most groups considered the features and facilities outlined in Section 2 of Appendix I, as “important” or “very important” to them.

- § Outside workers’ and the young people’s organisations indicated that the provision for parent and toddler facilities and the provision of emergency consumables were less important to them, and rated this as only “fairly important”.
- § The representative of the BME group also felt that the availability of a quiet area for breast feeding was “not important” to them.
- § The overall ambience of the facility, including the smell, absence of graffiti and the internal and external state of repair were also regarded as less important by the young people’s group, the outside workers, and the representative of the BME groups.
- § The latter two groups considered security features and the presence attendants to be of lesser importance and rated this as only “fairly important”.
- § The representative of the BME groups considered the helpfulness of attendants as “not important”.
- § All other groups felt that the sustainability features of public conveniences were generally “very important”, with the exception of the young people’s organisations who regarded such features as not so important to them and rated this only “fairly important”.

### ***1.4 Contrasting the findings of 2006 consultation on public conveniences with current results***

In 2006, a survey was conducted into the public’s perception of specific features of Council run public conveniences. These ratings were contrasted with participants’ ratings of the same features from the results of the recent workshop.

The results of the 2006 consultation show that the majority of respondents generally considered the various features of Council managed and provided

public conveniences to be “fairly good” to “very good”. These results are in contrast with the results of the current workshop in which participants regarded these same features as “mostly poor” to “fairly poor”.

These results *may* suggest that the quality of Council provided and managed public conveniences have declined since 2006. However, whilst the 2006 results were based on a statistically representative survey, the current research relies on qualitative feedback from focus groups. Given these two very different methodologies, it would be unsound to directly compare the two sets of results and extrapolate to firm conclusions about a change in attitude over time.

Table 2: Comparison of 2006 consultation findings with current results

<b>Features</b>	<b>2006 Consultation</b>	<b>Current results</b>
Opening hours	fairly good	mostly poor - fairly poor
Disabled access	fairly good – very good	mostly poor
Baby changing facilities	fairly good - very good	mostly poor
Cleanliness	fairly good - very good	mostly poor
Supplies	fairly good - very good	mostly poor - fairly poor
Attendants	fairly good - very good	mostly poor - fairly poor
Security	fairly good - very good	poor – fairly poor

(range: very poor, fairly poor, good, very good)

### ***1.5 Most important problems and issues that groups encounter when using public conveniences***

Participants in each of the groups were asked to rate the problems and issues they encounter when using public conveniences. From this list they were asked to specify the problems and issues which they considered to be most important. Participants identified four main areas of concern which they considered to be most important to them when using public conveniences.

### 1.5.1 Cleanliness

The overall **cleanliness** of public conveniences was a shared concern between most groups. Some groups (Older People's Forum and the Parent's Network) specifically raised their concerns over the manner in which toilets are cleaned. Related to this, they were concerned about cleaners' competency and the availability of essential consumables for maintaining sanitation within these facilities.

### 1.5.2 Lack of provision

The **insufficient number of public conveniences** was another shared concern amongst most groups. The disabled peoples organisations and the representative of the Parent's Network were particularly concerned over the **insufficient number of accessible toilets**. The **lack of provision** of facilities during weekends, match event days and in park locations (in particular, the lack of baby changing facilities) were also raised as the main concerns of the outside workers and the representative of the Parent's Network.

### 1.5.3 Accessibility

Most groups were in agreement about the need for improvements in the **accessibility** of public conveniences. The need for **better signage** was raised by most groups. In addition, the disabled people's organisations highlighted their requirement for an "**accessible map**" of the locations of toilets for disabled people. This group also emphasised the need to **meet the design standard** for toilets for disabled people as prescribed in the BS8300 standard.

### 1.5.4 Security and safety

Most groups considered the **security and safety** of public conveniences as one of their main concerns. In particular, the women's organisations raised their concerns over the **reputation and location** of certain facilities, while the disabled people's organisation also draw attention to the need for **audio and visual alarms** to benefit various types of disabled people.

## ***1.6 Priorities for improvement***

Participants were asked to identify three areas that they felt providers should prioritise for improvement, should a charging scheme for the use public conveniences be introduced. This is summarised below:

### **1.6.1 Cleanliness**

**Cleanliness** was identified by most groups as one of the areas that they would like to see improved.

### **1.6.2 Security and safety**

Most groups, who indicated willingness to pay for “on the spot charges”, specified **security and safety** as a priority for improvement.

### **1.6.3 Access (space & location)**

Improvements in **access to existing provision** (i.e. space and location) were also identified as a priority area if charging were introduced.

## ***1.7 Willingness to pay “on the spot charges”***

A **charge of 20p** was considered by most groups as a reasonable “on the spot charge”, for each use of the facility, provided that the specific improvements that they identified were guaranteed. However, three of the groups, representative of the Parents’ Network, young people’s organisations and representative of the BME groups, stated that they were unwilling to pay any “on the spot charges”.



## APPENDIX B



### 1 Executive Summary

The assessments were completed over 2 days; Monday 23<sup>rd</sup> and Tuesday 24<sup>th</sup> March 2009 and the Toilets Assessment Reports for each toilet are included in Appendices E to L of this report.

A Matrix of the type of toilets provided, together with facilities available and the BTA/LOY grading allocated is included in Appendix A, and a matrix of a number of key/common features is included in Appendix B.

An Accessible Toilet key features matrix is shown in Appendix C with a Baby Change Features Matrix at Appendix D.

Adult/child changing facilities (Changing Places Toilet) were not provided at any of the toilets assessed.

The Council has a portfolio of predominantly mature public toilets which, while generally satisfying user basic needs, historically, are now not generally best equipped for current needs.

The toilets were located across an area in and around the City Centre and catering for the needs of the busy city centre, suburban areas, parks, a cemetery and the Cardiff Bay area.

Of the eight PCs assessed six included accessible facilities and only three included baby change facilities.

The BTA have produced a Summary of Best Practice in 'Away from Home' toilet provision (section 4 below), upon which the assessment criteria used in this report was based.

The results of the assessments completed by the BTA (Appendices E to L attached) indicate that significant improvements in toilet provision is required if the Council's toilets are to achieve the 'excellence standards' it aspires to, and appropriate to the capital city of Wales.

Four of the toilets achieved a 3 Star grading, two a 2 star grading and the remaining two a minimum 1 Star grading. The Grading scale is from 1 Star (very poor) to 5 Star (Excellent standard)

- None of the toilets assessed achieve the ratio of female to male facilities of 2:1 in favour of females. Females are the dominant sex in UK, and for medical (e.g. pregnancy and menopause), physiological and sartorial reasons may need to use the toilet more often and take longer when they do – hence the queues outside ladies toilets.
- Only two were full time attended
- Only 38% achieved the basic Directional signage standard.
- 38% have adequate Location and Facility Signage.
- Only 25% display toilet opening times.
- Only one toilet displays emergency contact information.
- Only 50% have both hot and cold water supplied to wash basins.
- Only 38% have soap provided for hand washing.
- Cleaning standards are considered to be less than average in 37% of toilets.
- Only 25% of toilets have mirrors displayed in all toilets.
- Only 50% have hooks for users to hang their outer garments in all of the toilets they provide.
- Feminine Hygiene Disposal is provided in both female and accessible toilets in 50% of the toilet locations.
- The standard of DDA compliance was disappointing.

- No toilet location satisfies all of the basic DDA compliance criteria.
- 87%, of toilets assessed have DDA compliant doorway access.
- 87% of the toilet locations are accessible toilet overall dimension compliant.
- Disabled users can only reach the hand basin to wash their hands in 67% of accessible toilets.
- Only one accessible toilet has grab handles that are 100% compliant.
- 83% of the accessible toilets do not have compliant Emergency Pull Cord/Buttons.
- Sanitary product disposal is not provided in 33% of accessible toilets.
- Baby change facilities are only provided in 38% of the toilets assessed.
- No baby change facility had full hand washing facilities.
- Only one baby change facility had a WC for the parent or carer to use.
- No baby change facility had 'child friendly fittings or décor.

## APPENDIX C

Photographs taken by the BTA during site surveys

### 1. Secluded entrance to Caerdelyn Parc toilets



### 2. Possible location for taxi rest base – Llandaff Fields



### 3. Night time provision in the City Centre – Frederick Street



#### 4. Poor standard of facilities



This page is intentionally left blank

**SWYDDFA CYMORTH Y CABINET  
CABINET SUPPORT OFFICE**



County Hall  
Cardiff,  
CF10 4UW  
Tel: (029) 2087 2087  
www.cardiff.gov.uk  
**Neuadd y Sir**  
Caerdydd,  
CF10 4UW  
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2088  
www.caerdydd.gov.uk

Fy Nghyf / My Ref : CM35787  
Eich Cyf / Your Ref : RDB/PM/BD/06.09.16  
Dyddiad / Date: 27th January 2017

Councillor Paul Mitchell  
Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee  
Cardiff Council  
County Hall  
Atlantic Wharf  
Cardiff  
CF10 4UW

Annwyl / Dear Paul

**Environmental Scrutiny Committee - 6 September 2016**

Thank you for your correspondence concerning the above and I apologise for the delay in responding. I have liaised with my officers and can advise as follows.

**City Operations Directorate Quarter 1 Performance Report**

Officers are presented a Neighbourhood Services Member Update on 1 November 2016 and they outlined the Balanced Scorecard approach that is being taken forward with regards to this new service and its associated delivery. The key KPI's will not fundamentally change, although they may be rationalised and with new measures introduced to support the Balanced Scorecard approach being taken forward.

It is agreed that where reporting does not allow indicators to be published, due to validation, that further written information is provided with regards these measures.

The deep clean exercise is a weekly exercise that takes place on a cyclic basis around the 8 inner wards. The weekly programme is below. It is envisaged that it may take 4 weekly visits to cleanse every street in a Ward depending on its size and the cleanliness issues identified.

12/09/2016 Cathays

19/09/2016 Splott

26/09/2016 Butetown

03/10/2016 Grangetown

**ATEBWCH I / PLEASE REPLY TO :**

Swyddfa Cymorth y Cabinet / Cabinet Support Office - Ystafell / Room 5  
Atlantic Wharf, Caerdydd / Cardiff, CF10 4UW

**difference** make the | **wahaniaeth** gwnewch

10/10/2016 Canton  
17/10/2016 Riverside  
24/10/2016 Cathays  
31/10/2016 Plasnewydd  
07/11/2016 Adamsdown  
14/11/2016 Splott  
21/11/2016 Butetown  
28/11/2016 Grangetown  
05/12/2016 Canton  
12/12/2016 Riverside

There are several aspects that take place with regards the deep cleanse. The main cleansing aspect is to remove all detritus from a street including weeds. This work predominantly takes place in the gutters but can also be around trees, adjacent to properties or under pedestrian barriers. Teams are also in place to undertake any ground maintenance to grass areas or open spaces and cleansing of road signs, if required. A gully cleansing team operates in the ward for a week and they will cleanse drainage gullies across streets within that ward. Finally all defects for pavements, street lighting and signs, will take place across that ward to remove all defects that have been identified.

The current funding will allow the blitz work to continue until the end of the financial year and following a review, recommendations will be made on what resources may be required as we move forward.

Fly tipping is concern for many Local Authorities and Neighbourhood Services are working hard to look at measures to improve the position moving forward. The following measures are now being implemented:

1. Two fly tipping enforcement cameras have been procured and are in the process of being implemented.
2. Digitisation of the fly tipping and enforcement processes to support improved data management and processing of enforcement.
3. A fly tipper App is being developed for citizens to report fly tipping directly into our Asset Management system so there is improved reporting of issues.

Cardiff Council utilise FlyMapper to report and manage flytipping in the City. FlyMapper is for use by UK public and charitable sector organisations that are participating in the FlyMapper project - a new approach to the recording and management of fly tipping crime. The system is presently being used many local



authorities and organisations in Wales where it is coordinated by Fly-tipping Action Wales.

### **Commercial & Collaboration – Quarter 1 Performance 2016/17**

I can confirm Commercial and Collaboration officers are working up new performance indicators through the business plan and these will be made available to scrutiny for consideration at the earliest possible opportunity.

As with any service delivery plan the links to the strategic objectives will be clearly made and backed up with action plans and smart targets and objectives

Commercial and Collaboration have collated all the existing objectives and key performance indicators. These are being built into the new business plan and will be tracked and progress of the new service needs to be properly monitored on a quarterly basis to ensure that savings and improvements are being delivered. This information is all being fed into the Council's quarterly monitoring report from Quarter 2 onwards. This includes service teams within Commercial & Collaboration are individually reported against within the quarterly performance reporting structure.

### **The City of Cardiff – Draft 2016 Air Quality Progress Report**

Following the recent committee meeting enquiries were made in relation to Swansea's Live Road Traffic Pollution Update System and how such schemes were put in place.

The system detailed is known as Nowcaster developed by OPSIS of Sweden. The system has the ability to forecast poor air quality conditions within any identified street up to 8 hours in advance of those conditions occurring and to attempt redirection of traffic from those areas. Nowcaster will produce an hourly list of the road links predicated to fail any predefined level for a particular pollutant. The software would generate advice for drivers to take alternative routes or use park and ride sites. In the case of Swansea, the traffic emissions forecast model uses data from 30 solar panelled Automatic traffic Counters (ATCs) that have been installed within the Swansea area; meteorological data from the Danish Met Office and real-time air quality data from the City's existing air quality monitoring stations in the City Centre.

We have liaised with Swansea Council to gather more information on the system and the costing of such a project. In terms of the system as a whole the likely costing can range between £50,000- 500,000 depending on the scale of the project. Individually the ATC units cost £8,000 and the meteorological data which is supplied by Dutch Met Office costs 6,500 (Euros) per annum to be able to access and retain this data with an automatic feed onto the server.

It must be noted that the Nowcaster system in Swansea is not yet complete due to a number of I.T security concerns and software issues.

However, the theory behind the idea is creditable and one of the main aims of the system will be to raise awareness to the public of air quality issues and to try and alter driving habits to target the on-going traffic related emission concerns.

Further detail on how Swansea's Nowcaster system functions and portrays its information has been summarised in a document compiled by Swansea Council and is available at the following;

[http://www.welshairquality.co.uk/documents/seminars/25040914\\_P\\_Govier.pdf](http://www.welshairquality.co.uk/documents/seminars/25040914_P_Govier.pdf)

In relation to lobbying of bus operators this is something that Shared Regulatory Services (SRS) is unlikely to be able to lead on and is not something that can be successfully achieved in isolation by one service area. Any such measures to pressurise/ lobby the operators of buses would require support from other service areas within the Council. Any such lobby would therefore need to be undertaken most likely by the full Council/ Leader in which SRS would look to fully offer our support, as the uptake of cleaner buses and other vehicles in Cardiff is an important element in trying to improve air quality for the City. This is even more important now given the commitment for a world leading Clean Air Strategy within the draft Corporate Plan. We can obviously assist in providing data on air quality and reviewing of air quality assessments, but SRS is not in a position to lead on the full lobbying of bus operators.

### **Public Convenience Outline Strategy 2016**

On behalf of the City Operations Directorate; officers would like to thank the Environmental Scrutiny Committee for providing them with the opportunity to present the Cardiff Council Public Convenience Outline Strategy 2016; at their meeting on the Tuesday 6 September 2016.

Please find below responses to the Members comments and observations.

Officers welcome the Members support in respect of the use of existing 3rd Party mobile phone apps as a tool for Signposting and communicating the locations of Public Toilets in Cardiff.

Officers would also like to confirm that the same information will be available through a number of means, including the Cardiff Council Website and lists / maps distributed to organisations expressing particular interest in the subject or with identified relevance to the subject matter e.g. Age Concern, RNIB, etc.

As with Cardiff Council and many other local authorities nationally, Sterling Council has experienced changes and have had to implement a number of austerity measures. As such Sterling Public Conveniences strategy Comfort Partnership Scheme (CPS) involves a formal agreement between the Sterling Council and a partner who was already providing toilets for the use of its patrons. The agreement extends the use of these facilities for wider public usage and allows for the public conveniences to be signed as publicly available. In Sterling, recompense, is provided to the partner in the form of a small payment to augment extra cleaning and other costs. This provision, if supported, will differ in Cardiff with the partner facility benefiting from direct promotion of the business/facility by the Council and 3rd sector promotion.

In both cases schemes are intended to supplement or replace existing facilities, without the need to consider building new standalone Public Conveniences. For reference a copy of the Sterling Public Conveniences Strategy Comfort Partnership Scheme (CPS) has been attached to this letter as Appendix 1.

Officers would like to thank the Committee for bringing their 2008/09 Public Convenience Inquiry to their attention. They would like to reassure the Committee that where possible given economic restraints and resources every effort will be made to ensure the improved availability and quality of Public Conveniences within the city.

In respect of Changing Places toilets. Members are correct in their understanding Changing Places toilets, are Public Conveniences which specifically cater for the needs of Children and Adults with greater care needs and their carers. Such facilities are state of the Art; and often include adult changing beds for incontinence, ceiling mounted Hoists, height adjustable wash hand basins and WCs. More information on changing Places WCs including maps can be found at <http://changingplaces.uktoiletmap.org/>

Furthermore, it has been identified that many Changing Places toilets, currently available within Cardiff Council facilities are not currently listed on the above website. This will be addressed within the strategy, and significantly increase the illustrated number of Changing Places toilets currently signposted within Cardiff

Officers welcome the Members ideas and comments about public urination in the city centre, particularly during the night-time economy. Although whilst these comments are outside the direct influence of this Strategy; they will be fed into the night-time economy strategy which is currently being developed by fellow officers within Policy & Partnerships.

Officers acknowledge that although the main intent of the strategy is to raise the profile of where public conveniences are located in Cardiff. Where feasible every effort would be made towards improving the public convenience infrastructure through future developments and partnerships. By way of example this approach is already being implemented through Officers actions, with an increase in public conveniences availability and quality including Changing Places toilets being provided in many of our and our Partners facilities; such as Community Hubs, St Davids Retail Shopping Centre and indeed it is hoped that a Changing Places toilet will be included in the upcoming Transport Infrastructure Hub.

Again officers would like to thank the Environmental Scrutiny Committee for providing them with the opportunity to present at their meeting on the Tuesday 6 September 2016.

I trust the above is of assistance. If you have any further queries, please do not hesitate to contact either myself or my officers direct.

Yn gywir / Yours sincerely



**Y Cynghorydd / Councillor Bob Derbyshire**  
**Aelod Cabinet Dros Yr Amgylchedd**  
**Cabinet Member for Environment**

Enc: Appendix 1 - Sterling Public Conveniences Strategy Comfort Partnership Scheme (CPS)

Faint, illegible text at the top of the page, possibly a header or introductory paragraph.

Second block of faint, illegible text, appearing to be a continuation of the document's content.

Third block of faint, illegible text, continuing the narrative or list of items.

Fourth block of faint, illegible text, possibly a section separator or another paragraph.

Fifth block of faint, illegible text, occupying a significant portion of the page.

Sixth block of faint, illegible text, appearing towards the bottom of the main content area.

Seventh block of faint, illegible text, possibly a concluding sentence or short paragraph.